

# International Journal of Human Sciences Research

## EDUCATIONAL POLICY AS A STATE TOOL: AN ANALYSIS OF THE BNCC FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE ALTHUSSERIAN THEORY OF THE SCHOOL AS AN IDEOLOGICAL APPARATUS

---

*Ivan Campos Claudia*

*Helid Spear*

All content in this magazine is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution License. Attribution-Non-Commercial-Non-Derivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0).



**Abstract:** The research proposed to study the National Curricular Common Base (BNCC), having as analysis category the theory of school as an ideological apparatus of State, by Louis Althusser and, as a central objective, intends to understand the process of domination and maintenance of classes in contemporary Brazilian society from the legal investigation linked to social theories of education. For that, we outline the following specific objectives: to understand the concept of ideology and reproduction in Althusser; understand the Althusserian theory of the ideological state apparatus; know the criticism of this theory, to be aware of its possible vulnerabilities; analyze the National Common Curricular Base from its creation and approval, to its characteristics and weaknesses; establish a relationship between the Althusserian theory and the BNCC; find possible contradictions in the BNCC, seeking to point out paths and possibilities for an emancipating school.

## INTRODUCTION

The only path to human emancipation is social, and our introduction to society, as a complex and varied human set, is carried out through school, since family interaction does not allow us a glimpse of society, but only of a limited portion of the human group. With a view to understanding the forces - abstract, and the laws - concrete, which modulate current human beings and project to modulate future ones, this study was carried out, which seeks an understanding of the National Common Curricular Base, the federal document that manages and determines the Brazilian education, through the Althusserian perspective and its perspective regarding the Ideological Apparatuses of the State.

Based on the analysis category of Louis Althusser's theory, it is observed that the purpose of the School institution is, as a tool of the State, the control of bodies and the

maintenance of classes in their current static form. Although this function is not exclusive to the School, its role as a reproducer of the workforce, in its capabilities and limitations, and a reproducer of production conditions, make this institution a central field of dispute in the political determination of the country, so that forces national and international intervene in the development of the Brazilian educational field and in the formulation of educational documents, as will be demonstrated in the development of this text.

At first, the most important points of Althusserian theory will be introduced for the understanding and development of this research, then the National Common Curricular Base will be presented, from the context of its formation and the institutions that influenced its current format to its parameters and currents. scientific and political institutions that idealized them. In this second stage, we draw parallels clearly demonstrating how these political forces and their concrete documental determinations are interpreted from the observation armed through the lens of Althusserian theory.

## METHODOLOGY

The study had a bibliographical-documental character and, therefore, was supported by scientific articles, books and documents. Initially, a literature review was performed. Next, the work was centered on the appropriation of the Althusserian theory for the use of the school as an ideological apparatus as a category of analysis. In the last stage of the project before production, a thorough investigation of the BNCC and the context in which its respective stages were presented and discussed by public and private bodies linked to education was carried out.

## **ALTHUSSER AND THE IDEOLOGICAL STATE APPARATUS**

Althusser's theory of the Ideological State Apparatus deepens and develops concepts brought by Marxists before him, such as Gramsci, and continues to be developed after his death, thus being vast in all directions. The research was carried out based on his main book on this subject, *Ideologia e os state Ideological Apparatus* (1970), so that we will stick to his notes in this work and will develop only from the concepts that are most central in our analysis, concepts that will be presented below in the most convenient order for your understanding.

### **THE STATE**

Being a central concept in discussions about politics, history and sociology, it is necessary to scrutinize the definition of the State adopted by Althusser in his work and how this definition influences the specific definitions regarding the Ideological Apparatuses of the State.

The classic Marxist definition of the State determines it as a "machine" of repression that allows the ruling classes to ensure their domination over the working class in order to subject it to the process of extortion of surplus value, that is, to capitalist exploitation (ALTHUSSER, 1970, p.31). Elaborating this concept from the Althusserian logic, we have the understanding that this State, defined in this way, is then, the State apparatus, which can be specialized, such as the police, the courts, etc. , but also the army and above. of this set the head of state, the government and the administration.

This demonstrates that the State is, then, the force of execution and repressive intervention. Even if it is not wrong, this concept of State does not at all meet the apprehension that we will make about the Ideological State Apparatuses,

for this reason Althusser characterizes this theory about the State as a descriptive theory, subject to improvement.

The previously defined State apparatuses will be referred to as Repressive State Apparatuses, for the reason that such a designation is better suited to the proposed developments of the Marxist theory of the State by Althusser. The term "repressive" indicates the functioning by violence characteristic of such devices, so that the state administration and bureaucracy can be considered violence, even if in a non-physical way.

The conceptualization of the Repressive State Apparatuses opens space for the definition of the Ideological State Apparatuses, which will be referred to in depth later on, but which, in general terms, are different and specialized institutions that may or may not be part of civil society . The Ideological Apparatuses of the State become valid as State apparatuses belonging to civil society when we pay attention to the elaboration of the previously constructed concept of State by Gramsci, presented here in the words of Althusser:

The distinction between the public and the private is a distinction that is internal to bourgeois law, and valid in the (subordinate) domains in which bourgeois law exercises its "powers". The domain of the State escapes him because it is "beyond the Law": the State, which is the State of the dominant class, is neither public nor private, on the contrary, it is the condition of every distinction between public and private. (ALTHUSSER, 1970, p. 45 and 46).

The theoretical studies that made it possible to understand this notion of State were essential for us to continue with research and delve deeper into the specificities of Althusserian theory.

## **PRODUCTION AND REPRODUCTION OF THE PRODUCTION CONTEXT**

In Althusser's writings, the author intends to demonstrate the factors that allow the existence of the state unit and the necessary production context to legitimize and organize the ways of life in capitalist society. To do so, the need to be able to produce and reproduce such conditions of existence and maintenance of Capital is addressed, addressing the bodies and ways to guarantee the preservation of social status.

The analysis of the production and reproduction of the production context is central to the observation of the documents that manage education, as the School helps to determine what are the common and individual future possibilities. In other words, the School guides the context under which there will be production, from the way individuals are treated, teaching them about hierarchy, gender, race and class, the way such individuals operate for themselves. In this way, the central role of education in maintaining social cohesion is perceived.

## **NATIONAL COMMON CURRICULAR BASE**

The National Common Curricular Base (BNCC) is the guiding document for national education policies, which began to be formally oriented in 2015 and went through several stages until its implementation at all levels of Basic Education, in 2018. It determines national policies in federal, municipal and state level, in addition to being a reference for teacher training, for guiding assessments, for preparing school content and determining the criteria for providing adequate infrastructure.

The guidelines established in the BNCC are in line with currents of thought in education that formulate child development based on the development of skills, which is the focus

adopted in the international evaluations of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) (BRASIL, 2018, p 13), thus demonstrating the main objective of these legal educational measures.

Work in its human form is, therefore, the *mediation* that man needs to construct himself historically. The centrality of work in society is precisely in its power to explain that society and history, and it cannot, however, be confused with the reason for being and the ultimate objective of man as a historical being. (PARO, 1999, p. 106)

The Paro declaration highlights work as one of the goals of education, but reiterates that this should not be the final goal of an education geared towards human beings and future workers.

## **TRAJECTORY OF FORMULATION OF THE BNCC**

Although the formal and documental orientation of the process began in 2015, the discussion about a common curriculum formulated for the national structure in its entirety is prior and began to be presented by the Ministry of Education in 2014.

The procedure that took place from 2014 with consensus and dissent to about a common national base and its three versions, told in a first phase with the participation of professors and specialists from universities through public consultation on the internet, which resulted in the first version. (ARELARO, 2019, p. 42)

The researchers Vera Maria Vidal Peroni, Maria Raquel Caetano and Lisete Gomes Arelaro present us with the stages of the formulation of the BNCC, pointing out that, in the first moment, a public consultation process was carried out with specialists and education professionals, in a democratic way.

In 2016, the second version of the BNCC document was made available and submitted for discussion at seminars held by

the National Union of Municipal Education Directors ( Undime ) and by the National Council of Education Secretaries ( Consed ). During this period, a MEC Management Committee was formed to receive suggestions from the seminars. (ARELARO et al, 2019, p. 42)

In a subsequent moment of structuring the BNCC, the MEC mediated the suggestions and interests of national politicians in order to increase them according to their fit in the project, but it is necessary to point out that the intervention of the private sector, carried out at this moment by the Lemann Foundation, already had access to the two versions of the program and had already sought specialists from the American *Common Core* to express opinions and guide the direction of the legislation.

The institution of the MEC Management Committee (Ordinance 790/2016 - BRASIL, 2016), included only members of the Ministry's secretariats, who were responsible for the definitions and guidelines that gave rise to the third version based on the reviews of international members, such as *The Curriculum Foundation*, English institution, *Accara*, Australian institution and Phill Daro and Susan Pimentel who worked on the American *Common Core*, in addition to Sheila Byrd Carmichael, who signed the BNCC evaluation (ARELARO, 2019, p. 42 and 43)

The BNCC was approved in 2017, in a third version that did not include high school and was unrelated to the idea of basic education. A hearing was promoted by the National Council of Education in each of the regions of the country between June and September of that year, in the following months the Base transited through the CNE in a non-transparent way.

[...] [the BNCC] It was approved disregarding the construction already produced by the educational institutions committed to quality public education and under

strong resistance from three counselors, representatives of entities nationals, who voted against the BNCC, as well as several institutions and associations of professors and researchers expressed their opposition to the BNCC. (ARELARO, 2019, p. 43)

The way in which the national legislation that determines all education in Brazil was approved demonstrates which interests this education is aimed at meeting. When a public consultation is carried out with experts and international educational bodies and their guidelines are taken into account more than the models proposed by national professionals, the country's own democracy is downgraded and the desire of International Capital is prioritized, contradicting, by principle, any humanist definition of education and disregarding the development of Nation unity in favor of serving sets or conglomerates of foreign Capital, which actively determined the process of formulating the Common National Curriculum Base, its ends and means.

## READING THE BNCC FROM THE ALTHUSSERIAN PERSPECTIVE

The final document is divided into the following parts: **Introduction**, which presents and justifies the elements of the Common National Curricular Base; **Structure of the BNCC**, which demonstrates how the presentation of the document pages was organized and teaches how to interpret them; and **The Early Childhood Education Stage**, **The Elementary Education Stage** and **The High School Stage**, which presents the list of school subjects, subdivided into thematic units, in their relationship with the objects of knowledge and the respective skills to be worked on in high school students. restrictively, even though it does not point out the methodologies by which teachers should develop such skills.

Although the document does not declare the way in which the skills to be developed,



which are the base of the Base, should be worked on, the educational policies point to the use of technology in the classroom and the search for more efficient didactics, evident through the analysis of the change in the workload of the new High School curriculum, in which General Basic Education, as understood in the previous division of subjects, has its general workload reduced from 2400 hours to 1800 hours and gives way to the Training Itinerary, which complements training students in over 1200 hours. The implementation of Training Itineraries forces students to decide which areas of knowledge they will focus on, since the verb to deepen can imply that the contents will be worked on more intensely than they were, which is not consistent with reality, students must choose between the following major categories of knowledge, referred to as integrated areas of knowledge, Human and Applied Social Sciences, Language and its Technologies, Natural Sciences and its Technologies and Mathematics and its Technologies - which, despite being anticlimactic, does not relate any discipline besides math.

Furthermore, part of the workload must be devoted to the Life Project discipline, which presumably sets out to prepare students aged between 14 and 17 to orchestrate the steps of their professional and personal lives from that moment on and for the rest of them, in order to believe that the determinations of the labor market, the relationship with the environment, politics and social relations are static for at least the next 70 years. The Life Project discipline is guided by the 10 General Competences of Basic Education, which will be presented and detailed below and guide all the disciplines and areas of knowledge worked on by the BNCC.

## THE 10 GENERAL SKILLS OF BASIC EDUCATION

The general competences that determine what and how education should be given in Brazil will be presented here in the way they are found in the official document and then will be detailed from the perspective that they serve as general guidelines for the ideological formation of the Brazilian citizen and which, as such, aims to pair its thoughts and ideas with those that favor the respective Nation-State and the internationalized world.

At the BNCC, competence is defined as the mobilization of knowledge (concepts and procedures), skills (practical, cognitive and socio-emotional), attitudes and values to solve complex demands of everyday life, the full exercise of citizenship and the world of work. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

For Althusser, school learning can be divided into the following fronts: *Technical*, teaching reading and writing and training in mathematical operations; *Elements of scientific or literary culture of direct application in production*, these two fronts defining practical knowledge, which differ according to the social position intended for that individual; *Rules of behavior*, teaching respect for social and corporate hierarchy; and the *Dialectic*, being the teaching of “doing well” for future capitalists and “obeying better” for employees (ALTHUSSER, 1970 p. 20;21). The fronts of school learning that most concern the respective skills will be connected.

## HISTORICALLY CONSTRUCTED KNOWLEDGE

Valuing and using historically constructed knowledge about the physical, cultural and digital world to understand and explain reality, continue learning and collaborate in building a fair, democratic and inclusive society. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

The first general competence to be taught

and developed according to the BNCC deals with the use of historical knowledge in the development of learning itself and of society, and is, effectively, a demonstration of a study of history that justifies the social level in which we find ourselves and therefore to its characteristics and presents the intention of projecting the students to carry out a social change according to the official historiography, disregarding the multiple versions of history, applying it in the analysis as a science of accuracy, and denying the possibility of developments against -cultural , not agreed with the official social and state bodies.

This competence, then, for Althusser, would be a competence that applies the elements of scientific culture in a pragmatic and problem-solving model of analysis, and, in this way, reinforces the rules of behavior

### ***INTELLECTUAL CURIOSITY***

Exercise intellectual curiosity and resort to the approach proper to the sciences, including investigation, reflection, critical analysis and imagination and creativity, to investigate causes, elaborate and test hypotheses, formulate and solve problems and create solutions (including technological ones) with based on knowledge from different areas. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

Intellectual curiosity, as proposed by the National Common Curricular Base, is methodical and scientific, but more specifically, it limits the very curiosity that it claims to stimulate by linking it to specific scientific methods of the natural and exact sciences, in which there is the possibility of solving problems, for example, without regard to philosophy and ethics, but valuing knowledge as a solution tool and discrediting the questioning curiosity that could focus on the human and the social.

Thus, it is possible to say that the second competence presented by the document is, according to Althusser, one that values

the elements of scientific culture of direct application in production, but disqualifies science that is not aligned with international and State interests.

### ***ARTISTIC MANIFESTATIONS***

Valuing and enjoying the various artistic and cultural manifestations, from local to global, and also participating in diversified practices of artistic-cultural production. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

The analysis of competence with regard to artistic manifestations begins by pointing out the economy in its presentation . Generically, it determines that citizens should perform and enjoy the arts and has a globalizing dimension.

Given the pragmatic general character that is imbued in the education characterized by the document, it would not be wrong to determine that, in view of the fronts that the school serves according to Althusser, the analyzed competence attributes elements of the literary culture of direct application in the production, being these the manifestations artistic activities valued when one takes into account the usefulness of an artistic intervention, but which also teaches about the rules of behavior, of indirect application in the world of work, but which serves as a strong factor of world cohesion, placing globality at the center of modern human culture, without bothering to point out how insignificant this makes our individual and not collective actions, given the global proportions, which, in turn, says a lot about the individualizing ideology paired with the BNCC.

### ***USE OF DIFFERENT LANGUAGES***

Use different languages - verbal (oral or visual-motor, such as Libras and writing), corporal, visual, sound and digital -, as well as knowledge of artistic, mathematical and scientific languages, to express yourself and share information, experiences, ideals and

feelings in different contexts and produce meanings that lead to mutual understanding. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

The competence related to the use of different languages is related to the globalized world and the dialectic, proposing languages as a means to the end of communication. The way in which this competence is presented according to the Althusserian perspective is based on its link with dialectics, the teaching of good command and better obedience, but it is also related to the rules of behavior if we observe that the only foreign language inserted in the document is English, a determination that highlights international standards of behavior.

### ***DIGITAL TECHNOLOGIES***

Understand, use and create digital information and communication technologies in a critical, meaningful, reflective and ethical way in the various social practices (including school ones) to communicate, access and disseminate information, produce knowledge, solve problems and exercise protagonism and authorship in life personal and collective. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

In addition to the globalizing character previously discussed, the BNCC proposes an education for the future integrated with technological advancement, even though not one hour of the new workload is entirely dedicated to the study of technology, intending that the same be done during the studies of the areas of knowledge, in their new reduced schedule, or from Training Itineraries, subject to their offer by schools.

The Althusserian analysis would allow us to perceive that the competence in question has a primarily technical nature, since it seeks technological training but not the proper appropriation of the digital, it intends that citizens are able to use the technologies at their disposal but does not determine no capacity

for creation in the digital world, enabling communication and reproduction.

### ***DIVERSITY OF KNOWLEDGE AND EXPERIENCES***

Valuing the diversity of knowledge and cultural experiences and appropriating knowledge and experiences that allow you to understand the relationships of the world of work and make choices aligned with the exercise of citizenship and the life project, with freedom, autonomy, critical awareness and responsibility. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

The competence in question elaborates on the co-opting character of the capitalist model, which encompasses ideas in order to pair them with the ideals of the market, it dictates on the appropriation of knowledge that differs from the school canon, but points them to the realization of this same canon, citizenship and life project.

The observation of the competence described allows us to observe the effort to treat the multiple experiences with which students necessarily have contact as divergent from their own cultural and individual construction, as if the culture promoted by the school, in its Eurocentric character, were its core and the other interpretations of the world were added to it externally. In this way, it can be stated that, in an Althusserian perspective, the competence in question deals with the application of elements of literary culture in production, but also with the rules of behavior, especially when dealing with the ways in which this knowledge must be applied and the hierarchy under which to which they must be submitted.

### ***ARGUMENTATION BASED ON FACTS***

Arguing based on facts, data and reliable information to formulate, negotiate and defend common ideas, points of view and decisions that respect and promote human rights, socio-environmental awareness



and responsible consumption at the local, regional and global level, with an ethical stance regarding the care of oneself, others and the planet. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

By describing the characteristics that should be taught and valued in the student's relationship with the other, competence number 7 also deals with how these students should be, what values they should follow; the list that presents these values is extensive, but leaves the main thing, weighting and control, which starts in itself and ends in itself, implied. So that competence in particular deals directly with the dialectic, already contextualized in market means, and is strongly linked to the rules of behavior, thus determining the workers who will be trained in the school environment, the way they will communicate and the purposes that will have their actions. communications.

### ***SELF-KNOWLEDGE AND SELF-CARE***

Know yourself, appreciate yourself and take care of your physical and emotional health, understanding yourself in human diversity and recognizing your emotions and those of others with self-criticism and the ability to deal with them. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

Strongly related to the two previous competences, this one, number 8, brings the elements through which the student must deal with himself. Maintaining its own functioning should be prioritized, even though this is the competence that has the least amount of dedication in the document among the 10. The explosion of psychological illnesses in the last century knocks on the door of education of the future, not to rethink this as the cause of self-imposed harm, but to determine that we need to take care of ourselves.

The total distortion of the well-being of the individual with the well-being of the environment in which he lives is evident when the competency, which deliberately chose to

be one of the most reduced in the document, does not address, at this very opportune moment, the relationship between well-being and project of life, given that life does not take place in a vacuum, but at a specific historical and biological moment, and is subject to social influences and climatic characteristics.

At first, it was presented about what competence does not deal with, now, we will say that, from the Althusserian perspective, the competence in question disposes about the rules of behavior with oneself, relating them to self-control, or even, the ability to not to revolt with revolting situations.

### ***CONFLICT RESOLUTION***

It exercises empathy, dialogue, conflict resolution and cooperation, respecting and promoting respect for others and human rights, welcoming and valuing the diversity of individuals and social groups, their knowledge, identities, cultures and potentialities, without prejudice of any kind. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

By focusing on conflict resolution, the BNCC already presents the development and appreciation of dialectics and the pragmatic character with which it looks at education, dedicating itself to developing the objective and treating it as central, as more important than the object that makes it possible. At the same time, it presents the values, as it does in the entirety of this document, which should guide the possibilities of thoughts and existences, therefore determining the rules of behavior, bringing a reality without prejudice, as if they were determined at the individual level, and did not emerge from a common imaginary.

### ***PERSONAL AND COLLECTIVE ACTION***

Act personally and collectively with autonomy, responsibility, flexibility,

resilience and determination, making decisions based on ethical, democratic, inclusive, sustainable and solidary principles. (BRASIL, 2018, p. 8; 9)

The determination of rules of behavior in the final general competence goes beyond the description of how to act, dictates action as a mode of behavior. The action, valued in the BNCC, starts from the common principle of disconnection between thinking and acting, theory and practice, treating these actions in a way that diverges from the praxis as elaborated by Paulo Freire, and hierarchizing action over thinking, decharacterizing intellectual work, necessary for education itself.

## CONCLUSION

Dealing with the general competences as established in the official document first allows us to perceive its liberal vocabulary, generalist, abstract and cute determinations, which do not seek to be related to the current reality of public schools and the subjects of law who enjoy this school system.

Althusser gives us the possibility of understanding, following methodological principles, the way in which the School shapes thought, and the bases on which it does this, relating ideology to content, method and the school format itself, these being precisely the main factors on which the BNCC legislates. We can, therefore, extrapolate and say that the document that was analyzed is the official way of thinking of Brazilians from now on, especially if we consider the emphasis on determining the formation of the citizen as presented in the Base, the pillar of national education, alongside education for work and personal development, which show, respectively, state submission, economic bias and individualism.

The document, which has 600 pages, tries to delimit and present the ways in which national education is being given, bringing content,

curriculum and tending methodologies, thus being rigid as to the possibilities of teaching on national soil. Now, for a real analysis of the effects of legal determinations, it is necessary to remember that Brazil presents divergences between the elaboration and the fulfillment of laws, and that, as is characteristic of a vocabulary that intends to be accepted, the text itself demonstrates gaps that teachers and other education professionals must fill with their own developments in the classroom.

In this way, the best way to describe the final proposition of this study is to say that the BNCC is the terrain on which new educational disputes will take place, and that this terrain by itself has already been the result of disputes and tends today towards the maintenance of the models of production and reproduction and preserves Brazil's subaltern position on the international scene, but presents work possibilities that deviate from this trend.

## CI PROGRAM EVALUATION

Research is an essential part of any investigation, and as such it must be developed with rigor and methodology. The Scientific Initiation program made it possible to understand the research process and highlighted its importance in the theoretical deepening, which served as the basis for the support and elaboration of the text that followed.

The process of researching the document, followed by an in-depth look at the author and his theory and then returning to the national document allowed the analysis not only of the document itself but also the identification of specific procedures of the ideological apparatus of the State that is the School and its influence in my education and understanding of the world. A rigorous analysis of the meanings of general competences was only possible after understanding the impact of teaching dialectics ideologically paired with

the interests of the State.

Understanding this process, which preceded the formulation of the BNCC itself, allowed me, thanks to the proximity of the process itself and its effects, to formulate

a text that presents seriousness in dealing with the theme, and rigor and criticality, in understanding how it affects my field of work as a pedagogue and education theorist.

## REFERENCES

ALTHUSSER, L. Ideologia e aparelhos ideológicos do estado. Lisboa: Martins Fontes. 1980.

BOURDIEU, P; PASSERON, J. A Reprodução: Elementos para uma Teoria Educacional. Petrópolis: Vozes, 2014

BRASIL. Ministério da Educação. Base Nacional Comum Curricular. Brasília, 2018.

FARIA. Pierre Bourdieu, Maurício Tragtenberg e o reprodutivismo na instituição escolar. Londrina: Universidade Estadual de Londrina, 2010.

LOCH, Silvana Aparecida; ROCHA, Elisangela Aparecida. A escola como aparelho ideológico do Estado: reflexos do neoliberalismo no discurso escolar. In: CELLI – COLÓQUIO DE ESTUDOS LINGUÍSTICOS E LITERÁRIOS. 3, 2007, Maringá. Anais... Maringá, 2009, p. 2103-2110.

NOGUEIRA, C. O ensino médio no Brasil nos governos FHC: um estudo a partir da teoria althusseriana. Campinas: Universidade Estadual de Campinas, 2014.

SILVA (et al). Como a escola mantém o status quo. Curitiba: ENEPQ - Encontro de Ensino e Pesquisa em Administração e Contabilidade, 2009.

PARO, V. Professor: artesão ou operário? Editora Cortez. São Paulo. 2018.